come to a correct opinion, as indeed they might have been in any other matter in which they had no practical experience; and there is no evidence of any hasty decision, or want of such consideration as they were themselves able to give. The design they have chosen is in many respects creditable to its author. The elevation has, indeed, some excellent features; but we think is, nevertheless, quite equalled by several. The space devoted to the purposes of the club is very meagre, indeed quite insufficient; and the internal design, with all the advantage of the care which has been taken to shew it, is inferior to that of many other competitors. The second design, by the same author, is still less satisfactory; and if it found favour in the eyes of the committee at all, must have done so from its circular corner and window;—an indispensible requisite with those who, like the late author of the "Rejected Addresses," "flatten their noses against the window pane." It is remarkable that some excellent designs in this competition are not favourably rendered in perspective; and, indeed, in one or two cases, a want of acquaintance with this essential requisite in the language of the art is betrayed, which we should not have to notice in the work of any properly educated artist. And, notwithstanding that the artistic skill shewn by some, would have received the admiration of professional judges, it cannot be supposed that with them the want of it in the one case, or the presence in the other, would have stood in the way of a fair examination into other evidence of design, which it would be scarcely safe to say is the case in a course like the present; whilst a gilt frame would be likely to give no more value to the design than it ought to possess. We allude to these points, because we think that some of them, or others invisible, must have occasioned a preference, having looked in vain for sufficient reason in other respects; and knowing, as we do, the anxiety of the committee to prevent any suspicion of unfairness, we are surprised they did not take the obvious course to secure both a just decision and their object in the competition, by seeking the opinion of persons able to see what would meet the purpose contemplated. To the allotment in the second instance, there may be less reason to object; for though the external features of Messrs. Fowler and Fisk's design are not what might be desired, the interior, in arrangement, is worthy of praise, as being well calculated to serve the purpose of the club.

In Mr. Tattersall's selected design, we find a basement story containing the kitchen department, the fittings arranged precisely as those of the Reform Club,* and a mezzanine, much after the same original. The morning room, on the ground floor, occupies the Pall Mall front, and above it is the drawing-room. The staircase and entrance are in the centre of the length, with a low tetrastyle portico to the doorway. The coffee-room is north of the latter, and has the form of the letter L reversed. It cannot possibly give the accommodation required. The servants' rooms occupy a former building, proposed in this design to be retained. The design exhibits a range of windows in the ground story, having architraves and cornices, above which is an arcade, a narrow open loggia being formed outside the drawing-room, looking on to Pall Mall. A good character, however, is gained by strengthening the angles, where the windows and arches of each floor are omitted, and above the entrance there is a central feature, formed by carrying up the parapet, and introducing sculptured accessories. In construction there are numerous doubtful points; the number of stairs shewn could not possibly take the members to the upper floor; and there must be a great mistake in the relative height of the proposed and adjoining buildings.†

In Messrs. Fowler and Fisk's design there is but one story below the street level, but three appear in elevation. The plan differs from most, in having an excellent coffee-room, and in placing the kitchen nearly on the same level, at the back, where it is open, and ventilated from above: lifts, and with them it is supposed much inconvenience and annoyance from smell, have been dispensed with. The kitchen at the United Service Club is similarly disposed, and it is stated with admitted advantage, although it is right to say that lifts are not so objectionable as might be supposed, and at the Reform Club they are scarcely ever out of order. Considerable merit is also claimed for the arrangement of the corridors, and other means of carrying out the purposes of the club. The principal rooms are also of good dimensions, and it has been stated that in each case, they exceed those in any existing club. The morning-room being in the usual place, and the entrance as in the other design, the coffee-room is at the north, being in width thirty feet, and extends to a length of a hundred feet. It will be lighted at the east end by windows, at about half its length by glazed compartments in the ceiling, and at its circular termination by a glazed dome light, supported by columns. In this part of the plan, at least, there would seem to be a great advantage over many designs, for in several that may otherwise have high merit, a room of eighty feet long and upwards is proposed to be lighted at each end only. The visitors' coffee-room would, however, bear some increase of light. On the first floor, the drawing-room, library, and card-room form one suite. The external design shews a rusticated basement, an order on the first floor, and an attic pilastrade. The order has a broken entablature, the columns supporting statues. A more important feature, in the shape of an arch over a large window, occupies the centre of the principal façade, and the building is there terminated by a triumphal chariot. The entrance is rather deficient in importance.

Passing through the rooms, we noticed that No. 1 had a basement, good in design, but that the plan had much loss of space in passages. No. 4, by Messrs. G. Vulliamy and Kennedy, had some good parts, although suggestive of their sources, and there moreover appeared to be something wanting in palatial character. No. 11, by Mr. George Truefitt, who it will be recollected has contributed some illustrations to our journal, is one of the only two Gothic designs, and has very considerable merit. It has much of continental character, with lofty roofs, central tower, and angular pinnacles, and the elevations particularly are drawn with great care and knowledge of forms. It cannot fail to give a degree of reputation to its author. In No. 19, Mr. Pickett, who lately published a curious book on "A New System of Architecture," has excited much laughter at his mode of illustrating his ideas. "Give your judgment," said a celebrated lawyer, "but never your reasons, the first may be right, the second is just as likely to be wrong:" to Mr. Pickett, we would say, as long as you advocate the principle of suspension in words, you may be worthy of attention, but when you attempt anything further, you prevent the investigation which possibly may be merited. The ordinary system in architecture has this advantage of Mr. Pickett's, that the principle of *support* is natural, whereas that of suspension always requires an explanation to do away with the first thought of insecurity. In No. 15, Mr. F. W. Fiddian has given a colonnade projecting from each front of the ground-story. In No. 22, there are statues at the angles, in places scooped out for the purpose, the angle of the roof being also interfered with. No. 23, by A. Salvin, has a projecting window to the morning room, which might have been made a more graceful feature. The pilasters above seem of very great length. The coffee-room here is 85 feet long, yet only lighted at each end. No. 24 shews some taste in the arrangement of the plan, which is scarcely borne out by the elevation. No. 25, supposed to be by Mr. Railton, has a large space occupied by the hall, but has a good coffee-room. The room is of the greatest width that could be got, so that it is entirely lighted from above, and a vault springing from columns, makes an excellent subject for a perspective interior view. The exterior is profusely enriched with sculpture, and the cantilevers of the cornice have Victories, but the basement might hardly have proceeded from the same hand, and could easily have been improved by strengthening the angles, or by placing piers beneath the pilasters above. Messrs. Allom and Crosse, No. 35, have a good plan with the entrance as in the other cases. They have introduced a picture-gallery beyond, which forms a good access to the coffee-room at the back. On the first-floor the library is placed apart from the drawing-room, and access is gained to it by a distinct staircase. The interior decorations seem to have been carefully considered, and are shewn in some clever sketches. Mr. Lamb's design, No. 38, would at once be recognized as one of his; he has displayed much taste, although we think scarcely succeeded in catching the palatial character, which, in opposition to one of the competitors, we think a club ought in some degree to possess. There are three stories, and all the windows have arched heads, with rustics round the archivolts. In this case the entrance is in Pall Mall; the lobby, hall and staircase, occupy the full length, and the latter is carried up to the top. We fear the light for the kitchen would have been deficient. The author of No. 39 has hardly taken the pains to explain himself, but the plans of some of the rooms appear to combine some valuable ideas. Mr. J. Johnson, No. 40, has the club-room looking into Pall Mall, with a large projecting window, which would seem to give all the advantages of the much-desired bow. The entrance is in the usual place. The coffee-room is lighted from above. An openloggia for smoking is provided at the top of the building. The perspective view,—an admirable drawing, shews three stories, the basement having horizontal rustics pleasingly varied. The general design is an arrangement of superimposed columns, occupying central positions, and much ornament is introduced about the cornice and elsewhere, some of which may, perhaps, resemble too closely that on a neighbouring building in the square, also designed by Mr. Johnson.

In No. 41, by Wyatt and Brandon, there is a large arcaded porch to the entrance in St. James's-square, and a recessed loggia to the morning room, ingeniously planned, so as not to interfere with the internal decorations. The morning-room is here again 81 feet long, with windows at each end. The library is over the morning-room; would it not have been better to place the drawing-room next Pall Mall? An open loggia for smoking has been provided at the top of the building above the entrance. The mezzanine story in this design appears well elevated. The ground story and the top of the building are nicely treated, but the windows on the first floor scarcely please us so well. Much taste has been displayed in the interior decorations, which are well explained in sketches. Mr. J. Turner, No. 43, proposes to use brick and stone; he has employed a number of bow windows on the ground floor, and has introduced much sculpture. In No. 44, Mr. Owen Jones has not been able to forget the Alhambra, his design being throughout a clever attempt to reproduce that style. The entrance is in Pall Mall, and the plan generally seems to have been neglected, the mosaic pavements excepted. There are balconies enriched with ornament, and the angle of the building overhangs in a way that would present some difficulty in construction. On the pedestals round the building there are gigantic aquatic figures, holding the lamps. Mr. E. T'Anson's plan has rather a large space occupied by the hall; the exterior is arcaded in three stories, the angles strengthened and supporting obelisks, and there is an open loggia, as in other cases. No. 29, which we should have noticed earlier, is by Mr. C. J. Richardson. He has, with considerable judgment, elevated the mezzanine story about one step above the street, which is greatly to the advantage of the story below. There is therefore an ascent internally to all the principal rooms. Balconies are carried completely round to the principal stories. The design is marked by some originalities, and is well grouped with central features, elevated above the general cornice. Messrs. Parnell and Smith (No. 46) have adopted a rusticated basement, and an arcaded first floor with balconies. This is one of those designs which are not done justice to by the perspective view. The design of Mr. W. L. B. Granville has a good hall, well shewn in a perspective view. The elevation has three

* Vide THE BUILDER, Vol. IV.

† A correspondent sent us the following remarks:—"That Mr. Tattersall (No. 1) makes his cornice rather in the perspective view with that of Winchester House. Yet his cornice is according to his section and elevation, 50 feet high, while Winchester House is more than 70 feet. The author of the second plan, whose cornice above his first-floor windows is 6 feet above the street, makes that range with the Winchester House cornice, and sends the whole of his upper floor towering above the Bishop's whereas, in truth, his whole height is not equal to that of the adjoining house. The same mis-statement is shewn in the Pall Mall front with reference to the adjoining house, though perhaps not in the same degree. Such departures from fact should be discountenanced. If the first design were carried out as shewn, it would be buried between the adjoining houses—one rising 20 feet above it, and a shop in Pall Mall also above it to the west."

For more information on OCR and PDF Compression go to ThePaperlessOffice.org